

Attachment B4

**Summary of Submissions –
St Peter Julian's**

Summary of submissions
Table of contents

ST PETER JULIAN'S CATHOLIC CHURCH AND MONASTERY, 637-645 GEORGE STREET, HAYMARKET	2
URBIS FOR LANDOWNER	2
ST. PETER JULIAN'S CHURCH	7
DOCOMOMO AUSTRALIA INC	8
GLENN A HARPER	8

No.	Submitter ¹	Submission summary	Submission response
D St Peter Julian's Catholic Church and Monastery, 637-645 George Street, Haymarket			
D1	Urbis for landowner	Support and seek reduced listing. As outlined below. This submission was provided in two parts: a preliminary heritage assessment and a letter.	Support noted and issues responded to below.
D1	Urbis for landowner	<p><u>Significance</u> Preliminary assessment concludes St Peter Julian's Catholic Church has historic, associative and aesthetic significance on a local level. Urbis is undertaking community engagement to determine social significance. The building is an excellent example of post-World War II Modernist ecclesiastic architecture in NSW. Designed by Terence Daly, St Peter Julian's is one of small number of churches constructed in Central Sydney during the post war period. The execution of the façade materiality, proportion and ornamentation is of a quality and style unique in the council area, contributing to local character. The church interior has high aesthetic significance for the design and interpretation of the space, and for the quality and ingenuity of materials. The building design and its art collection exemplify the impact of wider international architectural trends, with clear connections to works of European artists and architects from Daly's travels, such as the stained-glass reredos and stations of the cross connections with works by John Piper and Le Corbusier. Artworks by notable European migrants demonstrate the proliferation and influence of post-war migrants in Sydney. The building represents the post-war growth of Catholicism in NSW and expansion of the Blessed Sacrament Congregation, internationally and in Australia. As one of the earliest churches to practice perpetual adoration, and to alter religious practices following the second Vatican council, St Peter Julian's represents changes to religious practice in Australia. As the first church in the world to be named for St Peter Julian Eymard, it represents the spread of the cult of St Peter Julian. The site includes the only monastery in the council area and has been in continuous use since construction. The detailed significance assessment should be reproduced in the inventory.</p>	<p><u>Significance</u> Support for the assessed significance of the building is noted. This assessment prepared for the landowner was exhibited with the proposal. This concurs with the study assessment that the building fulfils five Heritage Council listing criteria of local significance for its historic, associations, aesthetic/ technical, rarity and representative value, with potential for social significance. The building is assessed as significant as an accomplished example of post-World War II ecclesiastical architecture, the finest work of architect Terence Daly. It is also significant for its contribution to Haymarket's character, quality of materials and spaces, and works from notable migrant artists. It represents a rare post-war church and monastery in central Sydney, the largest church built of its period and only one including a monastery. It demonstrates twentieth-century religious practice in central Sydney, with strong associations to the Blessed Sacrament Congregation.</p> <p>The assessment compiles considerable research on the building's features and history. The additional aspects of significance from this assessment about religious practice and comparisons have been included in the inventory. The submitted assessment has also been added as a reference to the inventory as a source for further detail when this cannot all be accommodated in the inventory.</p>

¹ Submitters are named with permission from the submitter

No.	Submitter ¹	Submission summary	Submission response
D1	Urbis for landowner	<p><u>Associations significance</u> For associations significance, confirms this is the best work of Terence Daly, however disputes Daly's historical importance as a less recognised architect of his time.</p>	<p><u>Associations significance</u> These points have added to the inventory, noting the importance of Daly is yet to be determined. This does not affect the building meeting the associations significance criterion for at least its connection to the Blessed Sacrament Congregation, as expanded with further detail in the submitted assessment.</p>
D1	Urbis for landowner	<p><u>Social significance</u> Urbis is in the process of community engagement to determine the significance of the place to the community. While incomplete, a preliminary review of responses overwhelmingly indicates that the place is primarily important to the community for amenity reasons only. The responses generally place value on the place for four key qualities; its convenient location, the times of the services, the diversity of the congregation and the peaceful quality of the internal space. There are no strong responses which convey a community attachment with the building itself. The architectural style of the building does not particularly resonate with the community. The valued qualities could be retained by another building on this site. It is recommended that the heritage inventory does not make any assertions about the potential social significance until Urbis completes its assessment. The inventory can then be updated.</p>	<p><u>Social significance</u> The building has not been assessed in the study as meeting this criterion as one of the seven potential Heritage Council criteria for listing; only as potentially socially significant. The existing inventory assessment acknowledges that further investigation is required. The submissions in support of the heritage value and listing of this building from heritage bodies, professionals and community members indicate it has potential social significance. The assessment of social significance can be updated to take into account the finalised consultation review from Urbis when received.</p>

No.	Submitter ¹	Submission summary	Submission response
D1	Urbis for landowner	<p><u>Significant features and alterations</u> Provides grading of building elements. The spaces and fabric of most significance include: George Street façade and materials, form of the east and west facades, light court space at second floor, main nave form, nave ceiling form and fabric, stained glass clerestory windows, sanctuary space, Lady Chapel space including stations of the cross, reredos (stained glass mosaic), fibreglass baldachin, bas relief St Peter Julian, bas relief of the Virgin Mary (Lady Chapel) and tabernacles.</p> <p>The interior of the ancillary spaces to the rear of the church building and the interior of the monastery building to the south of the site have been largely altered. Except for the Lady Chapel, the majority of the monastery's interior fabric was removed in the 2008 refurbishment. It has no internal fabric of assessed moderate or higher significance. Due to renovations and changes of use over time, few areas of significant fabric or design remain in ancillary spaces. The successive changes prepared by Urbis should be included in the inventory to demonstrate the level of change to the fabric.</p>	<p><u>Significant features and alterations</u> The detailed description and fabric significance grading in this heritage assessment is noted. Original fabric or features graded as high, moderate, low or little significance may be too low for their relative significance, as noted in the Docomomo Australia submission. Council does not need to approve this detailed grading of fabric for listing. The detailed grading of fabric can assist the landowner with future development applications or preparation of a conservation management plan to seek a heritage floor space award. The detailed assessment in a conservation management plan is reviewed and endorsed by Council as part of the heritage floor space award process.</p> <p>The summary of most significant features, as identified in this Urbis submission, have been included in the supporting inventory, while noting further features may also be significant. The alterations are also acknowledged in the inventory. The submitted assessment has been added as a reference to the inventory as a source for further detail when this cannot all be accommodated in the inventory.</p>

No.	Submitter ¹	Submission summary	Submission response
D1	Urbis for landowner	<p><u>Listing extent</u> The item name does not sufficiently reflect the hierarchy of significant elements on the site. As the interiors of the monastery are not significant the following item name is proposed: "St Peter Julian's Catholic Church, Monastery, Lady Chapel and artworks, excluding Monastery interiors."</p>	<p><u>Listing extent</u> The detailed description, photos and grading of fabric provide sufficient information to support that altered private interiors in upper monastery levels have considerably less significance than publicly accessible or more intact spaces at the ground and first floors. The monastery still retains its original overall form and general layout. While the submission seeks exclusion of all monastery interiors, other than the ground floor Lady Chapel, the ground and first floors of the church nave, monastery and ancillary rooms retain publicly accessible, original or significant functions, form and layout, with some alterations. These two levels of church, monastery and ancillary rooms are also connected internally, encircling the church; for instance, the first floor monastery corridor is the side gallery to the church nave. As a result of the post-exhibition City review, it is recommended that the proposed item name for the building and significant interiors is revised to specify the "façade walls and fixtures, interiors of the church, ground floor, first floor, and artworks." This excludes the monastery interiors of levels 2-5 from the listing. The revised item name is consistent with the directions contained in the Standard Instrument (Local Environmental Plans) Order 2006 for item names to briefly describe significant features including interiors. An item name does not specify exclusions or a hierarchy of significance; only what is listed. Components of moderate, high or exceptional significance all meet the Heritage Office guidelines for local or state heritage listing. This includes elements with alterations that do not detract from significance and elements with little heritage value that contribute to the overall significance of the item. Listing these interiors does not require retention or direct the form of future development, but ensures impacts on significant features are assessed and new works integrated with existing features when major changes are proposed. The inventory has been updated to reflect this post-exhibition review.</p>
D1	Urbis for landowner	<p><u>Archaeological potential</u> The site is included on the Archaeological Zoning Plan for Sydney, although not as a result of detailed archaeological investigation. The preliminary assessment undertaken by Urbis shows that there is low – moderate potential for Aboriginal objects and that the historical archaeology requires further investigation. The inventory should either include reference to an archaeological assessment report or note only that the archaeological potential of the site requires further investigation.</p>	<p><u>Archaeological potential</u> The inclusion of the site on Archaeological Zoning Plan is part of its status as a result of an earlier assessment process that is not under review with this study. It flags the need for an archaeological assessment if excavation is proposed.</p>

No.	Submitter ¹	Submission summary	Submission response
D1	Urbis for landowner	<p><u>Historic themes</u> Urbis identifies 7 historic themes, with discussion, which should be added to the inventory. These are for specific local themes within the Australian themes of: peopling, phases of life, settlement and culture.</p>	<p><u>Historic themes</u> A summary of these additional historic themes have been included in the inventory, as a result of this assessment. The local historic theme of war memorial has been added. New local historic themes have also been created and included for this item: St Peter Julian, Blessed Sacrament Congregation, monastery and Chinese Pastoral Centre.</p>
D1	Urbis for landowner	<p><u>Other assessments</u> The inventory sheet must acknowledge the Urbis CMP, currently being completed, to ensure users are guided to a current heritage management document. The inventory sheet must also acknowledge the relevant archaeological report which has informed the assessment if available.</p>	<p><u>Other assessments</u> The Urbis preliminary heritage assessment has been added to the inventory as a reference. The CMP can also be noted when finalised and received for future inventory updates.</p>
D1	Urbis for landowner	<p><u>Opportunities and constraints</u> The most significant external fabric is the principal (east) façade and to a lesser degree the west façade. The monstrance and the crucifix on the eastern façade are of high significance. Artwork visible to the street should ideally remain in situ. The form of the eastern entrance portico must be retained, with potential to replace doors. The building's presentation to the street is of high significance. Its overall envelope has the ability to be altered without a detrimental impact on this presentation. While the church ceiling is significant, the flat roof form of the church and north façade of the upper floor of the Monastery is not. The building has potential as a podium to an appropriately setback and sympathetically detailed vertical addition. A vertical addition should retain the legibility of the highly significant open screen to the east facade. Structural engineer investigations are needed to determine the impact of vertical additions on the existing building. Ceiling skylights are a later alteration. These may be artificially lit with vertical additions to retain the existing internal light quality, similar to the backlighting to the windows in the Lady Chapel, the main reredos and stained glass behind the altar. Do not remove internal fabric that makes a defining contribution to the character of the building. No internal fabric of the monastery makes a defining contribution. Existing interiors can be sympathetically adapted and refurbished as required. All significant moveable heritage should be retained on site, including artworks created by notable European migrant artists.</p>	<p><u>Opportunities and constraints</u> These comments are noted and reproduced in this submission summary, as representing a preliminary assessment for the landowner, rather than Council's listing assessment in the inventory. The inventory management recommendations are appropriate. The comments in the submission and grading of significant features in the preliminary heritage assessment can assist the landowner with future development applications or preparation of a conservation management plan to seek a heritage floor space award. The detailed assessment in a conservation management plan is reviewed and endorsed by Council as part of the heritage floor space award or development application process.</p> <p>The management recommendations in the inventory provide guidance to landowners on conserving the building's significance. Development opportunities are not included in the inventory as these are proposed and assessed through the separate development application process. Listing ensures the heritage significance of the item is considered through this development process, together with other planning issues.</p>

No.	Submitter ¹	Submission summary	Submission response
D1	Urbis for landowner	<p><u>Management recommendations</u></p> <p>The recommended management prepared by Urbis should be reproduced in the inventory as follows. The significant elements of St Peter Julian's Catholic Church and Monastery of the Blessed Sacrament Congregation should be retained and conserved. Significant exterior elements include the overall composition of the principal (east) façade and its original high-quality materials. The stained glass is also of high significance and must be retained. Sympathetic vertical extensions to the chapel may be appropriate given the flat roof form. Any vertical extensions are required to be sufficiently set back from the front façade to enable legibility of the expressed structural grid which extends vertically above the roofline. Intact original internal fabric should be retained and conserved. Original fabric includes the principal chapel space and Lady Chapel. Alterations to the interior of the monastery are appropriate given the spaces were refurbished in 2008 with no fabric making a defining contribution to significance. Surfaces never intended for painting, including stone cladding, brickwork, marble and tiles, should remain unpainted and be maintained. Retain and conserve all artworks located externally and internally on site. Retain and conserve all original furniture associated with the church, such as timber pews. The Conservation Management Plan for the site should be used to guide future use and maintenance. Any application for future development involving structural changes and/or modification of original and significant building fabric should be accompanied by a Heritage Impact Statement.</p>	<p><u>Management recommendations</u></p> <p>These comments are noted and reproduced in this submissions summary, as representing a preliminary assessment for the landowner, rather than Council's listing assessment in the inventory. The inventory management recommendations are appropriate. The management recommendations in the inventory provide guidance to landowners on conserving the building's significance.</p> <p>Development opportunities are not included in the inventory as these are proposed and assessed through the separate development application process. Listing ensures the heritage significance of the item is considered through this development process, together with other planning issues. A heritage listing and the supporting inventory do not direct the form of future development. It is most appropriate to consider and address development issues at the development application stage when a detailed proposal is prepared. The non-prescriptive development assessment process for heritage items enables the form of development to be determined in response to the individual building features and circumstances, while also retaining significance. The views and issues of owners and their consultants are considered through this process. Owners are encouraged to arrange pre-application meetings with City planners for greater certainty about development plans.</p>
D2	St. Peter Julian's Church	<p>Information. Provides corrections for the inventory, including some references to the potter Kalmar named Stefan, not Julias, and typos. The monstrance and tabernacles noted in the description are no longer in the church.</p>	<p>These corrections have been included in the updated inventory.</p>

No.	Submitter ¹	Submission summary	Submission response
A2	Docomomo Australia Inc	<p>Support. This jewel of a church has undergone a number of extensions and alterations since the first stage constructed. The comprehensive assessment by the owner's consultants confirms the building is locally significant. Docomomo Australia supports this assessment of the building's significance. However, the levels of significance for individual elements could be reassessed with original fabric as exceptional, not merely high. Whilst original fabric was removed in the 2008 renovations, the renovated building retains the overall aesthetic of the original treatment despite the replanning of the main space to reflect liturgical changes of the Catholic Church.</p>	Support noted.
A15	Glenn A Harper	<p>Support. St Peter Julian's Catholic Church and Monastery (1964) is indeed an important late modern city church. Its restrained exterior, as expressed by a structural grid to George Street, certainly belies a rich and memorable interior.</p>	Support noted.